

PROFESSIONAL RESPONSIBILITY

“Always do right; this will gratify some people and astonish the rest.”
-- Mark Twain

“From the beginning, America has been a society based on law and forged by lawyers. . . . [J]ust as the law has been a principal means for founding, defining, preserving, reforming, and democratizing, a united America, America’s lawyers have been charged with setting the nation’s values—a charge that runs not only to “great cases” and major reform movements, but also to the lawyer’s day to day dealing with clients. In our society, **lawyers are and must be the conscience of both the legal system and the client**—for if they are not, no one will be.”
-- Dean John Sexton, NYU Law School

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. WHAT IS A PROFESSION?	1
A. DEFINITIONS	1
B. DIMENSIONS.....	1
II. THE PROFESSIONAL LAWYER	2
A. TWO EXTREMES.	2
B. A “PROFESSIONAL LAWYER”?	3
C. (CURRENT?) (TIMELESS?) PRINCIPLES OF OUR PROFESSION – PREAMBLE TO THE MODEL RULES OF PROFESSIONAL CONDUCT.....	3
III. WHY HAVE A PHILOSOPHY?	6
A. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST (RULES 1.7 & 1.9).....	6
B. PROVIDING COMPLETE LEGAL ADVICE (RULE 2.1).....	7
C. CONFIDENTIALITY (RULE 1.6).....	8
D. TERMINATING THE RELATIONSHIP. (ARMY RULE 1.16)	9
E. HANDLING EVIDENCE OR CONTRABAND (RULE 3.4(A)).....	10
F. CLIENT PERJURY (RULE 3.3; ABA FORMAL OPINION 57-353 (1957)).....	12
G. THE SERVICE AS THE CLIENT (RULE 1.13)	13
H. COMMUNICATIONS WITH THIRD PARTIES.	15
I. EX PARTE DISCUSSIONS WITH MILITARY JUDGE (ARMY RULE 3.5).....	16
IV. WHAT TYPES OF PHILOSOPHIES ARE THERE?	16
A. NEUTRAL PARTISANSHIP – CLIENT CENTERED	16
B. PHILOSOPHY OF MORALITY	17
C. PHILOSOPHY OF SOCIAL VALUE.....	17
V. DEVELOPING YOUR OWN PHILOSOPY	19
A. PERSONAL LEVEL	19
B. PRACTICE LEVEL.....	20
C. INSTITUTIONAL LEVEL.....	20

Maurice A. Lescault, Jr.

Lieutenant Colonel, United States Army

Professor & Chair, Administrative & Civil Law Department

The Judge Advocate General’s Legal Center and School, U.S. Army

March 2005

OUTLINE OF INSTRUCTION

I. WHAT IS A PROFESSION?

A. Definitions.

1. “A calling requiring specialized knowledge and often long and intensive academic preparation?” -- Webster’s New Collegiate Dictionary
2. “a group . . . pursuing a learned art . . . in the spirit of public service . . .” -
- Dean Roscoe Pound

B. Dimensions. Neil W. Hamilton, Symposium: The Future Of Callings - An Interdisciplinary Summit on The Public Obligations of Professionals Into the Next Millennium: 1999, 25 WM. MITCHELL L. REV. 43 (1999), citing William May, The Beleaguered Rulers: The Public Obligations of the Professional, 2 KENNEDY INST. ETHICS J. (Mar. 1992).

1. Intellectual Dimension

- a. “The professional must ‘profess’ something, namely a body of knowledge directed to a specific area of human need.”
- b. Correlative Virtue: “Practical judgment and discernment in the application of the body of knowledge for the benefit of the person served.”

2. Moral Dimension

- a. “A professional places the knowledge at the service of the human need of the persons to be served.”
- b. Correlative Virtue: “Fidelity to the person to be served. The professional reins in self-interest for the betterment of the client.”

3. Organizational Dimension

- a. “A professional belongs to an identifiable group, not just for self-promotion but for self-improvement.”
- b. “The difference between the cattlemen's association and a professional association is that the major purposes of the latter are: (1) weeding out the incompetent or unethical, (2) increasing the quality of the profession; and (3) service to others.”
- c. Correlative Virtue: “public spiritedness. The professional practices the art of acting in concert with others in producing and ensuring the quality of the service, and also in ensuring that the service reaches others.”

II. THE PROFESSIONAL LAWYER

- A. Two Extremes. Colonel Donald L. Burnett, Jr., *Twenty-Second Edward H. Young Lecture In Legal Education: Professionalism: Restoring The Flame*, 158 MIL. L. REV. 109 (December 1998).
 1. The Heroes of Our Profession: “Indeed, the reflective practitioner is the true hero of our profession today—a lawyer who understands that our professional responsibilities are threefold. First, of course, the lawyer is a **representative of clients**. This is the role of the lawyer as an attorney. Although anyone can be an attorney in a contractual sense—an agent for someone else—only lawyers are trained to be attorneys in the full professional sense, exercising an informed and independent judgment. Second, lawyers—unlike contractual “attorneys”—are **officers of the courts and legal system**. Third, lawyers are **public citizens having a special responsibility for the quality of justice**. All these roles are recognized, as you know, in the Model Rules of Professional Conduct.”
 2. The Strip Miners of Our Heritage: “The profession envisioned by Brandeis, and exemplified by his work, has no place for those who today are the strip miners of our heritage. These are the lawyers who stretch rules and ignore ethics, promote themselves while pretending to serve clients, try cases in the media while claiming to be courtroom lawyers, and engage in tasteless or predatory marketing of legal services—asserting, sometimes correctly, a First Amendment right to do so, but forgetting that professionalism means choosing a course of conduct higher than the minimum allowances of the law.”

- B. A “Professional Lawyer”? AMERICAN BAR ASSOCIATION, TEACHING AND LEARNING PROFESSIONALISM (1996).
1. “A professional lawyer is an expert in law pursuing a learned art in service to clients and the spirit of public service; and engaging in these pursuits as part of a common calling to promote justice and public good.”
 2. “The ideal legal profession is more than a group working with specialized skills on a job that requires expertise. It is a way of life in public service.”
- C. (Current?) (Timeless?) Principles of our Profession – Preamble to the Model Rules of Professional Conduct
1. The Role(s) of Lawyers: A lawyer is:
 - a. a representative of clients,
 - (1) As advisor, a lawyer provides a client with an informed understanding of the client's legal rights and obligations and explains their practical implications.
 - (2) As advocate, a lawyer zealously asserts the client's position under the rules of the adversary system.
 - (3) As negotiator, a lawyer seeks a result advantageous to the client but consistent with requirements of honest dealings with others.
 - (4) As an evaluator, a lawyer acts by examining a client's legal affairs and reporting about them to the client or to others.
 - (5) A lawyer should maintain communication with a client concerning the representation.
 - (6) A lawyer should keep in confidence information relating to representation of a client except so far as disclosure is required or permitted by the Rules of Professional Conduct or other law.
 - b. an officer of the legal system, and

LAMP COMMITTEE CLE
PROFESSIONAL RESPONSIBILITY

- (1) In all professional functions a lawyer should be competent, prompt and diligent.
 - (2) A lawyer's conduct should conform to the requirements of the law, both in professional service to clients and in the lawyer's business and personal affairs.
 - (3) A lawyer should use the law's procedures only for legitimate purposes and not to harass or intimidate others.
 - (4) A lawyer should demonstrate respect for the legal system and for those who serve it, including judges, other lawyers and public officials.
 - (5) While it is a lawyer's duty, when necessary, to challenge the rectitude of official action, it is also a lawyer's duty to uphold legal process.
- c. a public citizen having special responsibility for the quality of justice.
- (1) a lawyer should seek improvement of the law, access to the legal system, the administration of justice and the quality of service rendered by the legal profession.
 - (2) As a member of a learned profession, a lawyer should cultivate knowledge of the law beyond its use for clients, employ that knowledge in reform of the law and work to strengthen legal education.
 - (3) A lawyer should further the public's understanding of and confidence in the rule of law and the justice system because legal institutions in a constitutional democracy depend on popular participation and support to maintain their authority.

- (4) A lawyer should be mindful of deficiencies in the administration of justice and of the fact that the poor, and sometimes persons who are not poor, cannot afford adequate legal assistance. Therefore, all lawyers should devote professional time and resources and use civic influence to ensure equal access to our system of justice for all those who because of economic or social barriers cannot afford or secure adequate legal counsel.
- (5) A lawyer should aid the legal profession in pursuing these objectives and should help the bar regulate itself in the public interest.

2. Sources of Responsibility/Professionalism:

a. Many of a lawyer's professional responsibilities are prescribed:

- (1) in the Rules of Professional Conduct,
- (2) as well as substantive and procedural law.

b. However, a lawyer is also guided by

- (1) personal conscience and
- (2) the approbation of professional peers.

3. Handling Conflicting Responsibilities. In the nature of law practice, however, conflicting responsibilities are encountered.

a. Virtually all difficult ethical problems arise from conflict between a lawyer's responsibilities

- (1) to clients,
- (2) to the legal system and

- (3) to the lawyer's own interest in remaining an ethical person while earning a satisfactory living.
- b. Within the framework of these Rules, however, many difficult issues of professional discretion can arise. Such issues must be resolved through the exercise of sensitive professional and moral judgment guided by the basic principles underlying the Rules.
- c. The Rules of Professional Conduct are rules of reason. They should be interpreted with reference to the purposes of legal representation and of the law itself.
- d. The Rules do not, however, exhaust the moral and ethical considerations that should inform a lawyer, for no worthwhile human activity can be completely defined by legal rules.
- e. The Rules simply provide a framework for the ethical practice of law.

III. WHY HAVE A PHILOSOPHY? Discretion (or lack of discretion) in the practice of law. Some examples:

- A. Conflicts of Interest (Rules 1.7 & 1.9).
 - 1. **Directly adverse to the current client.** A lawyer shall not represent a client if the representation of the client will be directly adverse to another client unless:
 - a. The lawyer reasonably believes the representation will not adversely affect the other relationship, and
 - b. Each client consents after consultation (Rule 1.7(a)).
 - c. If a conflict develops after representation has been undertaken, the attorney must seek to withdraw.
 - d. Potential conflicts in legal assistance:

- (1) Estate planning.
 - (2) Debtor-creditor and seller-purchaser. *Compare Atlantic Richfield Co. v. Sybert*, 456 A.2d 20 (1983) (no conflict), with *Hill v. Okay Construction Co.*, 256 N.W. 2d 107 (1977) (conflict).
 - (3) Domestic relations. *Coulson v. Coulson*, 448 N.E.2d 809 (1983); *Ishmael v. Millington*, 241 Cal. App. 2d 520, 50 Cal. Rptr. 592 (1966).
2. Imputed Disqualification (Rule 1.10). Lawyers working in the same military law office are not automatically disqualified from representing a client. A *functional analysis* is required. Army policy may discourage representation of both parties in certain instances. AR 27-3, para. 4-9c. (Representation of both parties in a domestic dispute **discouraged**).
 3. Representation materially limited.
 - a. A lawyer is also precluded from representing a client if the representation would be materially limited by the lawyer's responsibility to another client, a third party, or by the lawyer's own interests (Rule 1.7(b)). **Example:** Defense counsel materially limited by loyalty to Army - result is ineffective assistance of counsel. *United States v. Bryant*, 35 M.J. 739 (A.C.M.R. 1992).
 - b. Representation is permitted if the lawyer reasonably believes that it will not be adversely affected by the interest **and** the client consents after consultation.
 4. **Former client.** A lawyer who has represented a former client shall not thereafter represent another person in the same matter or use information to the disadvantage of a former client (Rule 1.9).
- B. Providing Complete Legal Advice (Rule 2.1)
1. A lawyer may refer to moral, economic, social, and political factors when rendering advice to clients (Army Rule 2.1).

- a. Purely technical legal advice may sometimes be inadequate.
 - b. NOT a moral advisor as such. Discuss how other factors influence the way the law will be applied.
- C. Confidentiality (Rule 1.6)
1. General rule. A lawyer shall not reveal any information relating to the representation of a client.
 - a. No distinction between confidences and secrets.
 - b. Applies to information obtained prior to formation of attorney-client relationship.
 - c. Applies after death of client. *Swidler & Berlin v. United States*, 66 U.S.L.W. 4538 (U.S. Jun. 25, 1998) (No. 97-1192).
 - d. The Supreme Court of Oregon upheld a one-year suspension from the practice of law of a National Guard attorney who improperly disclosed military personnel information to the press. TJAG revoked his credentials to practice law for the Army in connection with the case. *In Re Lackey*, 333 Ore. 215; 37 P.3d 172 (2002)
 - e. Applies when reporting suspected judicial or lawyer misconduct. The Supreme Court of the State of Washington upheld a six-month suspension from the practice of law for attorney Schafer's disclosure of client confidences, concerning a judge, to the FBI, the prosecutor's office, the IRS and the press. *In Re Disciplinary Proceeding against Schafer*, (April 17, 2003) available at JACNET.
 2. Exceptions to confidentiality.
 - a. Permissive.
 - (1) A client may consent to disclosure of confidences (Rule 1.6). *See also* AR 27-3, para. 4-8a.

- (2) Disclosure is also authorized in order to carry out the representation.
- (3) Disclosure is permitted to establish a claim or defense in a controversy with a client.
- (4) Air Force Rules.

Air Force Rule 1.6(b)(1) leaves to the discretion of the lawyer (*i.e.*, lawyer *may* reveal...) the disclosure of information a lawyer reasonably believes necessary to prevent a client from committing a crime which is likely to result in imminent death or substantial bodily harm, or which will substantially impair the readiness or capability of a military unit, vessel, aircraft, or weapon system.

b. **Mandatory** for Navy/Marine Corps and Army.

Rule 1.6(b)(1) mandates disclosure of (*i.e.*, lawyer *shall* reveal...) information a lawyer reasonably believes necessary to prevent a client from committing a crime which is likely to result in imminent death or substantial bodily harm, or to prevent a client from committing a crime which will substantially impair the readiness or capability of a military unit, vessel, aircraft, or weapon system.

c. There is no authority for revealing information of other potential offenses or past offenses under the Rules.

D. Terminating the Relationship. (Army Rule 1.16)

1. Notwithstanding any other provision of the rule, a lawyer shall continue the representation when ordered to do so by a tribunal or other competent authority.
2. A lawyer SHALL seek withdrawal (or not commence representation) if -
 - a. the representation will violate the rules

LAMP COMMITTEE CLE
PROFESSIONAL RESPONSIBILITY

- b. the lawyer's physical or mental condition materially impairs her ability to represent the client; OR
 - c. the lawyer is dismissed by the client.
3. A lawyer MAY seek withdrawal if it can be accomplished without material adverse affect to the client's interests OR -
- a. the client persists in a course of action which the lawyer reasonably believes to be criminal or fraudulent;
 - b. the client has used the lawyer's services to perpetrate a crime or a fraud;
 - c. the client persists in pursuing an objective which the lawyer considers repugnant or imprudent; OR
 - d. other good cause for withdrawal exists.
 - (1) Good cause to withdrawal may arise when a Reserve Component Officer is ordered to active duty for more than 30 days. Army Regulations generally prohibits Judge Advocates from practicing law in the private sector while on active duty.
 - (2) An attorney of the JALS will not engage in private law practice without the prior written approval of TJAG. . This requirement does not apply to RC members of the JALS unless they are ordered to active duty for more than 30 consecutive days. See AR 27-1, Judge Advocate Legal Services, paragraph 4-3.
- E. Handling Evidence or Contraband (Rule 3.4(a)).
- 1. If the client informs the lawyer of the existence of the evidence but **does not relinquish possession:**

- a. Lawyer should inform the client of the lawyer's legal and ethical obligations regarding the evidence.
 - b. Lawyer should refrain from either taking possession or advising the client what to do regarding the evidence (*See* USATDS SOP, para 1-13).
2. If the **lawyer receives** the evidence or contraband.
- a. A lawyer shall not:
 - (1) Unlawfully obstruct another party's access to evidence;
 - (2) Unlawfully alter, destroy or conceal a document or other material having potential evidentiary value; or
 - (3) Assist another person to do so.
 - b. A lawyer who receives an item of physical evidence implicating the client in criminal conduct shall disclose the location of or shall deliver that item to proper authorities **when required by law or court order** (Comment, Rule 3.4(a)). *United States v. Rhea*, 33 M.J. 413 (C.M.A. 1991) (defense counsel have duty to surrender evidence which implicates their clients).
 - c. If a lawyer receives **contraband**, the lawyer has no legal right to possess it and must always surrender it to lawful authorities. (Comment, Rule 3.4).
 - d. If a lawyer receives **stolen property**, the lawyer must surrender it to the owner or lawful authority to avoid violating the law. (Comment, Rule 3.4).
 - e. Concealment, destruction, alteration, etc., could be a violation of UCMJ art. 134, Obstruction of Justice.

3. If the lawyer discloses the location of or delivers an item of physical evidence to proper authorities, it should be done in a way designed to protect the client's interests, including:
 - a. Client's identity.
 - b. Client's words concerning the item.
 - c. Client's privilege against self-incrimination.
 - d. Other confidential information.

4. Advice on handling evidence or contraband:
 - a. Do not accept the item!
 - b. Advise the client of the consequences of continued possession and voluntary turn-in. Do not advise the client of what to do regarding the evidence. Also, advise the client of the lawyer's obligations regarding the evidence.
 - c. If possession cannot be avoided, turn it in to the proper authorities.
 - (1) Do not dispose of it or conceal it.
 - (2) Do not destroy or alter the evidentiary quality.
 - (3) Upon turn-in, refuse to disclose client identity and circumstances of your possession to the extent permitted by applicable case law.
 - d. There is no protection from court-ordered disclosure.

- F. Client perjury (Rule 3.3; ABA Formal Opinion 57-353 (1957)).

1. **Former ABA position.** Allow client to testify in narrative form and not use the testimony in argument.
 2. **Current position.** A lawyer who knows that his or her client intends to testify falsely must . . .
 - a. Advise the client not to do so and explain the consequences of doing so, including the lawyer's duty to disclose.
 - b. Attempt to withdraw (if the lawyer's efforts to dissuade the client from testifying falsely are unsuccessful).
 - c. Limit examination to truthful areas or do not call the client to testify at all.
 - d. If above not possible, disclose to the tribunal the client's intention to commit perjury.
 - e. If perjury has already been committed, persuade the client to rectify it.
 - f. Disclose the perjury if unsuccessful.
 3. A lawyer "knows" that a client intends to testify falsely if the accused has admitted facts to the lawyer that establishes guilt and the lawyer's independent investigation establishes that the admissions are true, but the accused insists on testifying. (Comment, Rule 3.3).
 4. A lawyer may also refuse to offer evidence that the lawyer reasonably believes is false. (Rule 3.3(c)).
- G. The Service As The Client (Rule 1.13).
1. The respective service, acting through its duly authorized officials, is the client. Army lawyers may be authorized to represent individual clients as legal assistance attorneys or trial defense service lawyers.

2. Attorney-client relationship exists between the lawyer and the service -
 - a. As represented by the commander or head of the organization.
 - b. As to matters within the scope of the official business of the organization.
 - c. Commander or head or organization cannot invoke attorney-client privilege for his or her own benefit.
 - (1) Communications between a commander and an SJA may be disclosed to the commander's superiors and to investigators appointed by the superior.
 - (2) Advice to a commander from the SJA is protected from disclosure to opposing civilian counsel. However, the same advice may be disclosed to the commander's superior or delegated investigators if there are allegations of impropriety or misconduct.
 - (3) DA IG investigators commonly interview legal advisors and often the SJA's testimony is critical to the resolution of an allegation of impropriety or misconduct. See the CSA Summary (October 2002), The Army as Client, LTC Craig Meredith, available at JAGCNET.
3. If a commander engages in unlawful activity, or intends to act, or refuses to act in some manner that violates his or her legal obligation and may be imputed to the Army, the lawyer shall proceed as is reasonably necessary in the best interest of the Army. This may include:
 - a. Ask the official to reconsider.
 - b. Advise that a separate legal opinion be sought.
 - c. Advise official that his personal legal interests are at risk and he should consult counsel.

- d. Advise that the lawyer has an ethical obligation to preserve the ethical interests of the service and must consider discussing the matter with supervisory lawyers.
 - e. Refer the matter to or seek guidance from higher authority.
 - 4. In no event may the lawyer participate or assist in any unlawful activity. If the official persists, the lawyer may terminate representation with respect to the matter in question.
 - 5. The lawyer has an obligation to clarify the lawyer's role. The lawyer must identify the service as the client when it is apparent that the service's interests are adverse to that of the officer, employee or official. (Rule 1.13(e)).
 - 6. An SJA may not serve as the personal legal advisor to a commander on matters of alleged misconduct without the approval of the TJAG.
- H. Communications with Third Parties.
 - 1. A lawyer shall not discuss a case with another party who is represented by an attorney, except as authorized by law (Rule 4.2). *See* Army Professional Responsibility Committee Opinion 93-2.
 - a. A lawyer may not accomplish communication indirectly through an agent or encourage clients to contact opposing parties.
 - b. Communication with a party concerning matters outside the representation is permissible.
 - 2. Rule 4.2 permits a lawyer representing a private party in a controversy with the government to communicate about the matter with government officials who have the authority to take or recommend action in the matter, provided the sole purpose of the lawyer's communication is to address a policy issue, including settling the controversy. (ABA Formal Opinion 97-408)
 - a. The lawyer must give government counsel reasonable advance notice of his intent to communicate.

1. Principle of Professionalism. In their professional roles, lawyers may do anything that is not a *clear* violation of the rules or the law.
2. Principle of Nonaccountability. When acting in this professional role, lawyers are not legally or morally accountable for their actions.
3. Lord Brougham, as quoted in 2 TRIAL OF QUEEN CAROLINE 8 (J. Nightingale ed., 1821):

An advocate, in the discharge of his duty, knows but one person in all the world, and that person is his client. To save that client by all means and expedients, and at all hazards and costs to other persons, and, among them, to himself, is his first and only duty; and in performing this duty he must not regard the alarm, the torments, the destruction which he may bring upon others. Separating the duty of a patriot from that of an advocate, he must go on reckless of consequences, though it should be his unhappy fate to involve his country in confusion.

- B. Philosophy of Morality. “lawyers are morally accountable for the actions that they take on behalf of their clients and must be prepared to defend the morality of what they do.”
- C. Philosophy of Social Value. “The lawyer should take such actions as, considering the relevant circumstances of the particular case, seem likely to promote justice.” William H. Simon, *Ethical Discretion in Lawyering*, 101 HARV. L. REV. 1083 (April 1988)
 1. Two Considerations.
 - a. Relative Merit. “[L]egal services are necessarily a scarce resource. The legal system cannot be indifferent to the distribution of this resource.” Simon, *supra*.
 - (1) “In deciding whether to commit herself to a client's claims and goals, a lawyer should assess their merits in relation to the merits of the claims and goals of others whom she might serve.”

- (2) The criteria the lawyer should employ in making this assessment are suggested by the bases of legal concern about the distribution of services:
 - (a) the extent to which the claims and goals are grounded in the law,
 - (b) the importance of the interests involved, and
 - (c) the extent to which the representation would contribute to the equalization of access to the legal system.
 - b. Internal Merit
 - (1) Substance and Procedure
 - (2) Purpose and Form, and
 - (3) Broad and Narrow Framing
2. Commitment to the Rule of Law. Six Values at the Core of Professionalism. Timothy Terrell and James Wildman, *Rethinking "Professionalism,"* 41 EMORY L.J. 403 (Spring 1992)
 - a. An Ethic of Excellence;
 - b. An Ethic of Integrity: A Responsibility to Say "No";
 - c. A Respect for the System and Rule of Law: A Responsibility to Say "Why";
 - d. A Respect for Other Lawyers and Their Work;
 - e. A Commitment to Accountability;
 - f. A Responsibility for Adequate Distribution of Legal Services.
3. Social Morality. W. Bradley Wendel, *Public Values and Professional Responsibility,* 75 NOTRE DAME L. REV. 1 (October 1999).

- a. “For the public morality conception of legal ethics to function effectively as an alternative to incorporating personal ethical beliefs into professional decision making, the moral values that bear on professional decisions must derive from the social function of lawyers. If these public normative principles do indeed arise from the role of lawyers, then they function as a constraint on the personal morality of individuals acting as professionals, rather than the other way around.”
- b. Three Principles
 - (1) Loyalty
 - (2) Seeking Justice
 - (3) Ethic of Care or Mercy

V. DEVELOPING YOUR OWN PHILOSOPHY. NATHAN M. CRYSTAL,
PROFESSIONAL RESPONSIBILITY 6 - 37 (1996)

Within the framework of [The Model] Rules, many difficult issues of professional discretion can arise. Such issues must be resolved through the exercise of sensitive professional and moral judgment guided by the basic principles underlying the Rules.

-- *Preamble*, ABA Model Rules of Professional Conduct

The perplexing nature of [professional responsibility] problems usually flows from . . . tensions or conflicts between three ideas that are central to the lawyer’s role: the lawyer as fiduciary, the lawyer as an officer of the court functioning in an adversarial system, and the lawyer as an individual with personal values and interests. . . . The tensions among these central aspects of a lawyer’s role generate the need for what can be called a “philosophy of lawyering” – a general approach to dealing with conflicts among these fundamental ideas. A philosophy of lawyering operates at three interrelated levels. . . .”

-- Professor Nathan Crystal

- A. Personal Level – How the lawyer integrates her personal and professional life

B. Practice Level – Dealing with uncertain questions of professional ethics.

These Rules do not . . . exhaust the moral and ethical considerations that should inform a lawyer, for no worthwhile human activity can be completely defined by legal rules. These Rules simply provide a framework for the ethical practice of law.

--Preamble, ABA Model Rules of Professional Conduct

1. Consider 4 possible factors:

- a. Client-Centered: Resolve questionable issues with an approach that favors the interest of the client.
- b. Defensive Lawyering: Adopt an approach that minimizes the likelihood of discipline.
- c. Officer-of-the-Court: Adopt the approach that is most consistent with the principles underlying the rules of professional responsibility.
- d. Personal Morality: Adopt the approach that is most consistent with your personal moral values.

C. Institutional Level – The set of **fundamental institutional values** that form the basis of the system of rules governing professional responsibility and lawyer behavior.

Many of a lawyer's professional responsibilities are prescribed in these Rules of Professional Conduct, as well as in substantive and procedural law. However, a lawyer is also guided by personal conscience and the approbation of professional peers. A lawyer should strive to attain the highest level of skill, to improve the law and the legal profession, to exemplify the legal profession's ideals of public service, and to respect the truth-finding role of the courts.

* * *

These Rules of Professional Conduct are rules of reason. They should be interpreted with reference to the purposes of legal representation and of the law itself.

--Preamble, ABA Model Rules of
Professional Conduct

1. Colonel Donald L. Burnett, Jr., *Twenty-Second Edward H. Young Lecture In Legal Education: Professionalism: Restoring The Flame*, 158 MIL. L. REV. 109 (December 1998).

- a. “During the early history of the United States, the role of the lawyer was understood to be that of **seeking justice**. The lawyer provided **a voice for community values** and, by serving many clients of different backgrounds, furnished a dynamic of inclusiveness within the community.”

- b. “Even in the first half of the twentieth century, a lawyer was known primarily for **service**. . . . [There is] something noble in helping real people in real situations, accepting their human imperfections and serving them in response to a higher calling.”

- c. “Jerome Shestack, president of the American Bar Association, has enumerated the elements of professionalism:

“First is fidelity to ethics and integrity as a meaningful commitment

“Second is service with competence and dedication—but with independence

“Third is meaningful legal education—not as a chore to meet some point system but as a means for growth and replenishment

“Fourth is civility and respect for authority. Let us resist the Rambo-type tactics in which civility is mocked and ruckus is routine. Civility is more than surface politeness; it is an approach that seeks to diminish rancor, to reconcile, to be open to non-litigious resolution. It modifies the antagonisms and aggressiveness of an adversarial society. . . .

“Fifth is a commitment to improve the justice system and advance the rule of law. The justice system is our trust and our ministry. And we bear the brunt of public dissatisfaction with the justice system’s flaws and deficiencies To make that limping legal structure stride upright is the obligation of every lawyer.

. . . .

“The final element of legal professionalism is pro bono service. . . . Much has been given to our profession; it seems right to give something back—indeed, it is an ethical obligation”

2. What pressures might cause lawyers to fail to live up to these values? Dean John Jay Douglass, *The Nineteenth Annual Kenneth J. Hodson Lecture: Military Lawyer Ethics*, 129 MIL. L. REV. 11 (1990).
 - a. **A**mbition: careerism, politics
 - b. **E**motion: provocation, personal acquaintance
 - c. **I**gnorance & Incompetence
 - d. **O**verkill
 - e. Simply **U**nethical: No personal code of behavior or morality